

LESSON 24: Governance and Development



REFERENCE

Page 401-403 [EXPOSURE & AWARENESS]



WHAT YOU NEED

- (2) (3) (4) LSM: 'Governance & Development'
- (2) (3) LSM: 'Mapping Society'

AIM

- To understand that while families, communities, and civil society have a responsibility to the common good, the state's obligations in this regard are greatest, because it has substantial power and means at its disposal

OUTCOMES

- KUI Learners understand that the state is a particular form of social organisation that practises social and political justice.
- KUI Learners understand the nature of the South African state, and its obligations to progressively increase the delivery of social and economic rights to all its citizens.

CLASSROOM QUOTES

'You shall appoint judges and officials throughout your tribes to administer true justice for the people in all the communities which the Lord, your God, is giving you. You shall not distort justice; you must be impartial. You shall not take a bribe; for a bribe blinds the eyes even of the wise and twists the words even of the just. Justice and justice alone shall be your aim, that you may have life and may possess the land which the Lord, your God, is giving you.' Some of God's commandments to the nation of Israel, Deuteronomy 16:18-20. (The book of Deuteronomy begins with Moses as the narrator – but by this point it's as if the *mouth* of Moses has become the channel for the *voice* of God.)

The 'task of a developmental state is to fight poverty and expand economic opportunities for the poor', and the 'two main thrusts of the budget of a developmental state must be how much the state spends fighting poverty and deprivation, and how much of the country's resources go towards expanding the economic opportunities of all its citizens.' South Africa's Minister of Finance, Trevor Manuel, addressing senior public service managers, 20 September 2004. (Quoted by Pali Lehohla in 'Synergies between Mbeki's plan of action and millennium goals', *Business Report*, 30 September 2004.)

TEACHER'S NOTE

The classroom quotes have been included in Section C on the Lesson Materials page 'Governance & Development' because both are quite long and both can be directly used in connection with Sections A & B. Suggestions on how you might do this are given in the Lesson Outline. Some learners may even refer to them when answering Sections A & B before you draw their attention to them.

 **BACKGROUND**

What do you think a state is? What is a state's responsibility? What features are needed to bring these things about? What is a 'weak state' or a 'failed state'? What is a developing state?

Let's begin answering this cluster of questions by considering what components are needed to make a state, and how these illustrate organisation and power. However, it's important to remember that this is just a list – the history behind any and all of these components will be complex and a multiplicity of resulting configurations are possible. But some of the following, at least, need to be present in one or other combination:

- *a defined territory (usually with a long history of conflict and moments of significant political settlements behind it);*
- *a central government;*
- *government capacity to exercise control (through the police and/or military, but also through consent, for example, of an electorate);*
- *government capacity to govern through the rule of law;*
- *the capacity of government to govern well (governance, good policy frameworks, development programs);*
- *an economy which, whatever linkages it has globally, has some viability coterminous with a country's territory (i.e. it's large enough to provide a tax-base which can fund government and its programs);*
- *and a government accepted by and able to work with other governments.*

If the form of government is democratic it needs to recognize that its authority and legitimation are given by the will of the people and that regular elections are needed to give voice to this. If it is a constitutional democracy then the constitution will provide the basic framework and measure for how government is to be structured, and governance exercised. And, in our age, the state's adherence to and promotion of human rights is a key measure of its legitimacy and claim to justice. Illustrative examples of these sorts of things can be found first in column D, but also column E, of the 'Mapping Society' matrix (See Lesson 1).

You can test these criteria by contrasting the colonial, segregationist, and apartheid state prior to 1994 with the current constitutional democracy that characterizes the South African state today. For instance, you might recall how opposition to apartheid was directed at challenging and undermining the strength and (very questionable) legitimacy of the apartheid state: the campaigns to declare apartheid a heresy, to isolate South Africa through sport and cultural boycotts and economic sanctions, to highlight the undemocratic and repressive nature of the apartheid state and the unjust nature of its laws; the call to 'make the country ungovernable'; and so on. Pressure came from within through the liberation movements, segments of the churches – think of the series of pastoral letters from the South African Catholic Bishops Conference, for instance – and civil society, the 'black' trade unions, and mass-based organizations such as the United Democratic Front. Pressure also came from without through those in the liberation movements in exile, segments of the churches and civil society throughout the world, the agency of African states and the Organisation of African Unity (OAU), sections of the commonwealth (particularly African countries, India, and Pakistan), and the UN (where South Africa's participation was limited to observer status and where the resolution condemning apartheid as 'a crime against humanity' was passed in 1973 – although it must be said that the US blocked many other resolutions). Again, you could look at where each of these sorts of organised actions could be placed on the 'Mapping Society' matrix – see Columns D & E in particular.

Thinking about our own history is useful because it shows that the authority and legitimacy of any state structure are linked, and conferred by its citizens. If a group or community, or even the

majority of the population, feel excluded, and organise to challenge their exclusion, then a crisis in legitimacy follows. The only way to resolve this is for a new, more broadly acceptable political settlement to be agreed on – much as we saw with the transition years in SA between 1989 and 1994. And this history strongly shapes our constitutional democracy and the way in which so much in our first 10 years of democracy has been directed at addressing the legacy of the past.

In many ways, our age is one of human rights, constitutions, and democracy – the legitimacy and authority of states that fail to uphold these will be called into question. But we must also acknowledge that economic factors play a critical role in weakening or strengthening the state – if too many people, or a large region of the country, feel left out and can't gain political or economic footholds, then civil strife follows. Thus, a concern with justice and the common good in relation to inclusion, good governance, and development belongs to us all. We can also extend this to our neighbouring countries, and our relationships with them, and beyond. Yet we should bear in mind that states do not like to have their competence, credibility, or legitimacy questioned – so a strong civil society, a free press, and an informed electorate play a critical role in keeping government accountable to the needs of all.

LESSON OUTLINE

1 Introduction

Tell the learners that they will be exploring the role of the state in relation to social and political justice. Refer them to the Lesson Materials page 'Governance and Development' and indicate that Section A invites them to explore a difficult situation that shows why state structures are needed. Say that in Section B they will look fairly closely at aspects that give definition to the South African state.

2 'Interesting Times'

Ask the learners – in pairs or small groups – to work on Section A of the Lesson Materials page 'Governance & Development'. Monitor their work and encourage them to work quickly. The following insert may guide you in providing assistance to groups and to shape a short period of feedback and discussion.

The scenarios and questions in Section A may elicit discussion around these sorts of things:

- *There is a need for social order and rules. This may be defined by a constitution, sanctioned by the public through democratic and other consultative processes, and enforced through normal policing and an independent judiciary. However, it could also be autocratic and take the form of a dictatorship, a military suspension of civilian rule, or a state of emergency.*
- *The state may serve its people fairly or unfairly. Some of the state's task is organisational and bureaucratic. It needs to keep the needs of the country as a whole in mind. It has the capacity to ensure human rights are met, or are in the process of being met. It has the capacity to provide governance, including a range of services.*
- *The state's role is to protect its citizens. The citizens have given it the authority to do so by voting for the state and paying taxes. The way a country is run may lead to peace or war.*
- *Leaders may be totalitarian or democratic. In times of repression, war, or fear leaders may be imposed on the people. In times of peace, it is more likely that the citizens agree to the leadership through elections or some kind of agreement.*

You could round off this part of the lesson by inviting learners to apply the quote from Deuteronomy to the role of the state – particularly with regard to the administration of 'true justice' and 'Justice and justice alone shall be your aim.' (The RSV puts this more strongly: 'Justice, only justice, shall you pursue...') The quote is given in Section C of the worksheet.

3 The Role of the State

Let the learners – in pairs or groups – continue with Section B. Again, monitor progress in the groups.

Some things to keep in mind and to listen for include:

- *The need for healing and redress with regard to all forms of historical exclusion and the way this relates to government policy – overcoming racial divisions is the obvious one, but gender and disability also need to be addressed. Land restitution, employment equity, and inclusion are examples of this.*
- *Being alert to discussion on the difference between equality and equity which will arise again. In many respects, the South African constitution privileges equity and redress over equality. Simple equality exists with regard to the right to vote or, in principle at least, in the sense of all being equal before the law. But equity is the means by which the historical processes and structures that produced patterns of exclusion and inequality can progressively be challenged and changed.*
- *What characterises an ‘open society’ – e.g. freedom to associate (to meet and form organisations including political parties or trade unions, etc.), freedom of speech (including a free press), freedom of movement, freedom of belief or conscience, a respect for diversity, recognition of the human dignity of all, and so on.*

Provide an opportunity for feedback and questions. Try to make the link between the ‘basic needs’ learners identified in the previous lesson and the government programs they should have named that are intended to improve ‘the quality of life of all citizens’. (You could – if time allows – invite thought on why freeing ‘the potential of each person’ goes beyond the requirements of ‘basic needs.’).

4 Conclusion

Refer the learners to the Trevor Manuel quote. They should be able to see the connection between this and intentions stated in the Preamble to the Constitution. They should also be able to make the link between human rights, redress, economic opportunity, development and social and political justice – and the words from Deuteronomy.

OTHER IDEAS

5 For Further Reflection

If you have not yet done so, invite learners to think about the relationship between Sections A and B, and the two quotes given in Section C of the Lesson Materials page ‘Governance & Development’.

MATERIALS

LEARNER

- CIE. 2005. ‘Governance and Development’



Lesson Materials

Governance and Development

Section A: 'Interesting times'

'May you live in interesting times' is an old Chinese curse. Think about the word 'interesting'. What might it be a euphemism for? Could it include, among other things, strange contrasts, social turbulence, and even terror. Now, imagine that you (and your partner or group) have been sent as journalists to report on the 'interesting' situation in a country you have never been to before. What you see shocks and frightens you. You keep a daily journal in which you write down your observations. Use the brief scenarios for the days listed below as the basis for generating observations and comments.

Day 1

You arrive in a very strange land. The strangeness only becomes obvious as you explore. There are no rules and no government or obvious way of ordering society. Write down the kind of things you notice.

Day 5

You get to a part of the land where there is a lot of food and clean water. The people are healthy and well-fed. Much of the food is wasted. You are shocked as you have seen incredible hunger and people squabbling over water in the last 4 days. How do you feel about this? List some of the questions you might ask or the issues that you might raise. What do you think needs to be done?

Day 7

You get to an area that is very densely populated. People are aggressive and there seems to be some kind of argument brewing between older and younger people. Groups of people are gathering everywhere and there is a lot of aggressive talk about other groups. What might be the cause of this tension between older and younger people? List some of the questions you might ask or the issues that you might raise. What might be the cause of the 'aggressive talk' directed at other groups of people?

Day 10

There has been a massacre. The fight you feared appears to have happened. There is a health crisis. There still seems to be no order or system of dealing with the problem that is increasing. What would be needed to at least bring the violence to a stop? What humanitarian assistance is immediately required? What medium to longer term steps are needed to establish a peaceful society?

Use your notes/...

Lesson Materials

GOVERNANCE AND DEVELOPMENT (cont)

Use your notes and comments to answer this cluster of questions.

- What seems to be missing in this strange land? What problems need to be addressed? Who should be responsible for doing what needs to be done? How could the people of this land get to a place where these things can be done? What structures would be needed? What would give these structures authority? What would give these structures legitimacy? (Ultimately, authority and legitimacy need to go together.)
- Obviously, in your discussion of these questions, people, communities, organisations, and institutions internal to this country need to play a key role. But did you also mention / consider the role that other countries or international agencies and organisations might play?

You can use the 'Mapping Society' resource from Lesson 1 to check your answers. You are likely to find Row 3, and the whole of Columns D & E helpful.

Section B: The Role of the State - South Africa as an example of a Constitutional Democracy

Some of your answers in Section A were probably shaped by your experience in South Africa. Let's explore this further. The preamble of the South African Constitution (Section 29, 1a, Act 108 of 1996) says that the aim of the Constitution is to:

'Heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights;
Lay the foundations for a democratic and open society in which government is based on the will of the people and every citizen is equally protected by law;
Improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person; and
Build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations.'

This is aspirational language. (See row 3 of 'Mapping Society' resource. Look at the definition and 3D.) But it also commits the state to implementing programs that are aligned with this vision.

- What 'divisions of the past' need healing?
- What do references to 'democratic values', 'social justice', 'fundamental human rights' suggest about this past? Why are these emphases necessary? How are they expected to bring about change (both fairly quickly and over the longer term) in South Africa?
- What is an 'open society'?

In what ways/...

Lesson Materials

GOVERNANCE AND DEVELOPMENT (cont)

- In what ways is the government 'based on the will of the people'?
- Can you name government programs intended to improve 'the quality of life of all citizens' and to 'free the potential of each person'?

Again, you are likely to find Column D of 'Mapping Society' helpful as you consider the nature of the South African state.

Section C: For further reflection

If time allows, you may wish to think about the relationship between Sections A & B and the two quotes that follow.

- 'You shall appoint judges and officials throughout your tribes to administer true justice for the people in all the communities which the Lord, your God, is giving you. You shall not distort justice; you must be impartial. You shall not take a bribe; for a bribe blinds the eyes even of the wise and twists the words even of the just. Justice and justice alone shall be your aim, that you may have life and may possess the land which the Lord, your God, is giving you.' [Deuteronomy 16:18-20].
- The 'task of a developmental state is to fight poverty and expand economic opportunities for the poor', and the 'two main thrusts of the budget of a developmental state must be how much the state spends fighting poverty and deprivation, and how much of the country's resources go towards expanding the economic opportunities of all its citizens.' South Africa's Minister of Finance, Trevor Manuel, addressing senior public service managers, 20 September 2004. (Quoted by Pali Lehohla in 'Synergies between Mbeki's plan of action and millennium goals', *Business Report*, 30 September 2004.)
- Can you see the relationship between social and political justice and the role of the state?

Lesson Materials



Mapping Society

(Through Needs, Roles, Activities, and Structures)

	A Family	B Community (traditional & religious)	C Society (including religious, civil, & economic activities & structures)	D The State (governance & [re-] distribution)	E Inter-state (and international)
<p>1 Identity and roles</p> <p>(Who you are in relation to others: as man, woman, or child in a family, any form of community, a workplace, and as a state citizen)</p>	Adult, father, mother, son, daughter, uncle, aunt, grandparent...	Member of a particular community; adult or child; initiated or not-yet-initiated; a subject under communal and / or traditional authority (unless you are <i>the</i> traditional leader, or your community is strongly egalitarian - but even then you are still bound to your community); an ancestor or saint in the making...	One or more of: member, leader, office bearer, worker, manager, learner, teacher, professional...	Citizen, bearer of rights & responsibilities, voter, adult or minor, & individual person (i.e. as one who is equal with others before the law; as one who is not discriminated against in terms of sex / gender, ethnicity / race, societal standing, class, etc.)	Global citizen / citizen of a nation-state / member of a community that holds rights (currently under discussion) / person with refugee status...
<p>2 Forms of power, authority, and governance</p> <p>(Power-over or power-with or power-exercised-on-behalf-of others)</p>	Parental, or senior head of (extended) family, guardian, or adult (- historically, often paternal or patriarchal)	Traditional leaders, councils (of elders - often older men), customary law (- historically, often patriarchal - e.g. 'the chief is like our father')	Through position; through membership; boss / management / qualifications / accreditation / professional associations, trade unions, political parties, etc.	Constitutional democracy (i.e. constitution, separation of powers, rule of law, and proportional representation through regular elections)	UN Assembly, International Court of Justice, Pan-African Parliament, negotiation, treaties, agreements (unilateral actions); degrees of international recognition or censure given to states

Lesson Materials
 MAPPING SOCIETY (cont)

	A Family	B Community	C Society	D The State	E Inter-state
<p>3 Ideational / ideological / representational</p> <p>(How family, community, society, state show themselves publicly - their ideals, aspirations (promises), values, & forms of practice)</p>	<p>Culture / Religion / Custom Genealogy / family stories Family practices / things that are done together or for one another (especially around the allocation of tasks, mealtimes, attendance at functions, ceremonies, and events)</p>	<p>Culture / Religion / Custom, rites of passage, traditional or religious dress, food, traditional celebratory or liturgical music & dance</p> <p>(Historically, often patriarchal - e.g. 'God is our Father')</p>	<p>Religion (e.g. love of God & love of neighbour; family values); education (e.g. opportunity, upward mobility); media (magazines, newspapers, radio, TV, advertising); sub-cultures & lifestyles (that may be counter-cultural or subversive) associated with work (e.g. hostels), youth, music (e.g. kwaito, hip-hop, rock, jazz), dress (fashion), sexual orientation and behaviour (e.g. gay or lesbian), or disability (e.g. the deaf & signing)</p>	<p>The constitution, the law, principle of equality, the nation / nation-building (in SA through affirming diversity), national symbols, national pride</p>	<p>UN Declaration of Human Rights or the AU Charter</p> <p>A vision of a family or community of nations</p>
<p>4 Institutional forms of association</p> <p>(What am I born into? What do I choose? How am I governed?)</p>	<p>Familial (Sexuality and Kinship)</p> <p>Single parent, nuclear family (more urban?), extended family (more rural?), child-headed households; monogamy, polygamy, polyandry; marriage, co-habitation, divorce, remarriage...</p>	<p>Traditional community (largely rural?) Initiation schools</p> <p>Several extended families, kinship ties or shared language and / or cultural norms</p> <p>Or shared belief – i.e. faith communities – which may be local or global</p>	<p>Voluntary or professional associations / organisations - clubs, political parties, religious organisations (e.g. churches), trade unions, guilds, professional bodies (e.g. for lawyers, teachers, doctors, etc.), workplace or work-related organisations, educational institutions (e.g. schools, colleges, technicons, universities)</p>	<p>Structures of government and political oversight from national to local levels: a presidency, cabinet, parliament, provincial legislatures, and local government (municipalities); government departments (such as welfare, safety and security, education, etc.), the police and military, the judicial system (courts, judges, magistrates), etc.</p>	<p>United Nations - the General Assembly & its agencies (ILO, UNESCO, WTO, etc.); International Court of Justice; African Union, European Union, Commonwealth, SADC countries, etc.; international coalitions of NGOs, etc.</p> <p>Diplomacy, ambassadors & consulates</p> <p>The International Monetary Fund (IMF) & the World Bank (WB) etc.</p>

Lesson Materials

MAPPING SOCIETY (cont)

	A Family	B Community	C Society	D The State	E Inter-state
<p>5 Material needs & economic arrangements</p> <p>(What do I need? How do institutions organise to meet these needs? What role does / should the state play?)</p>	<p>Access to basic needs: water, food, clothing, shelter, education, work, electricity, medical care (genetic disorders, nutritional disorders [associated with poverty], disability, childhood diseases, endemic disease [e.g. malaria; or in association with poor water, cholera; or in association with poverty and crowding, TB], epidemics [e.g. HIV], occupational [e.g. asbestosis, phthisis, disability], different health needs of men and women [e.g. reproductive health]</p> <p>Dowry / Bridewealth / Lobola systems; inheritance</p> <p>Household labour; household as unit of production</p>	<p>Access to communal land and its 'products' - water, soil, plants, animals, livestock, agriculture</p> <p>Forms of social welfare & subsistence – foraging & gleanings; forms of mutual assistance, especially with crop production - e.g. <i>ilima</i> / <i>letsema</i> / <i>davha</i>; forms of patron-client relationships – e.g. <i>ukusisa</i> / <i>ukunqoma</i> / <i>mafisa</i> / <i>kholomo yau swahelwa</i></p> <p>(Consider, too, which of these practices, historically and today, are among women, which among men, and which inclusive of both.)</p>	<p>Access to skills and (professional) qualifications through education and training (including apprenticeships / learnerships)</p> <p>Access to / control of one or more of these resources: capital, land, natural resources - flora and fauna, raw materials, labour, technology, production, exchange (e.g. the market)</p> <p>Access to paid employment: e.g. as a worker (unskilled, semi-skilled, skilled), artisan, professional, or manager</p> <p>Access to the monetary and market economy</p>	<p>Access to income through revenues and taxes.</p> <p>Provision through government spending on: social grants, pensions, subsidies, education, health care, housing, & free basic provision of services (water and electricity); public works programs; infrastructure (roads, railways, dams, communications, etc.)</p> <p>Regulation through policy and law of: water and land rights, private and communal ownership, employment legislation (including affirmative action and employment equity) , environment</p> <p>Provision through government-private partnerships / privatisation</p> <p>Control / access to one or more of: resources (land, natural resources - flora and fauna, raw materials and labour), technology, production, exchange</p>	<p>Loan agreements, structural adjustment programs, debt repayments,</p> <p>The WTO's General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs (GATT)</p> <p>The WTO's Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS)</p> <p>The US's African Growth and Opportunities Act</p> <p>G7 & G8 summits</p> <p>European Common Market, etc.</p> <p>International markets, stock exchanges, US dollar pricing, and currency fluctuation...</p>

LESSON 25: 'Free and Fair'?



REFERENCE

Page 405 [DEVELOPMENT OF CRITICAL THINKING]



WHAT YOU NEED

- (2) (3) LSM: 'Free and Fair'
- (2) (3) LSM: 'Justice as Process'
- (4) LSM: 'Mapping Society' (Lesson 24)

AIMS

- To help learners understand that justice is also about legitimate and acceptable processes
- To look at what 'free and fair' means in the context of an election

OUTCOMES

- KUI Learners understand the importance of due or just process - that just means are the best way to advance just ends.
- DAP Learners responsibly uphold and participate in democratic processes such as the election of a school Learner Representative Council.

CLASSROOM QUOTES

'... the threshold from authoritarian to democratic rule is crossed when the outcome of free and fair elections is accepted by those voted out of power, and the due process of constitutional law is acknowledged by all.'

(John W de Gruchy. 1995. *Christianity and Democracy: A theology for a just world order*. Cape Town: David Philip Publishers [Pty] Ltd., p 38)

TEACHER'S NOTE

BACKGROUND

You might have noticed that now that South Africa is a constitutional democracy that democratic practices have been introduced at many levels in society. This is the result of a political decision and is seen as way of redressing an authoritarian, undemocratic past, as well as a way of strengthening people's understanding and experience of democratic processes. Thus, the South African Schools Act (No. 84 of 1996) requires all schools, whether public or independent, to have a School Governing Body and a Learners' Representative Council.

If you think back to South Africa's first democratic elections in 1994, you might recall that they were preceded by negotiations, and that a special body, the Independent Electoral Commission was set up to run them. The whole process - pre-elections, during elections, and post-elections - was subjected to intense scrutiny: political parties watched each other, the IEC, and the process (often with suspicion) and the process was monitored by both local and international observers. This has continued in the two subsequent elections - and we have seen how elements of this process are present in elections in various African countries.

An important part of the democratic process is that everyone (or at least the major parties involved) can accept both the procedure and the results of an election. This lesson focuses on justice as process and tries to show that just means facilitate just ends; indeed unjust means would subvert, contradict, and damage the credibility and legitimacy of any outcome and the institutions involved.

In our age, democracy is seen as an important way of bringing peace to countries racked by conflict. This is because it is inclusive - it tries to bring everyone into a country's political process. It's much better than war - it's seldom that any party wins outright, and even if they did it would only cause resentment and fuel the potential for violence and civil war.

LESSON OUTLINE

1 Introductory Discussion

- i. Begin the lesson with a quick discussion on 'Why do citizens vote?'
(It gives them some say in government and in things that touch their lives - important points with regard to Learner Representative Councils too.)
- ii. And: 'Do elections equal democracy?'
(Try to elicit comments like: 'it depends how accountable to its people an elected government is'; 'it may be the form - i.e. window dressing, where government pretends to be democratic'; or 'the elections may be okay but the government may not be able to implement its plans because of debt and fiscal constraints, or pressure from the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, other governments, or multinationals'. But the point, for this lesson, is about due electoral process - that elections should not be rigged, that opposition parties should be allowed to campaign, that the press should be allowed to report freely, and so on. Thus, to have a democracy and a free and fair electoral process everyone, including those in power, must agree to play by the rules - i.e. procedural justice.)

2 Free and Fair

- i. Hand out the Lesson Materials pages 'Free and Fair' and 'Justice As Process'. On the 'Free and Fair' table, look at the phrase 'free and fair' with the learners and note that there is a set of criteria for each of 'free' and 'fair'. Point out that these criteria apply to national elections but, with small adaptations, could apply equally to LRC elections.
- ii. The learners use the table to answer the questions in Section A of the Lesson Materials Page 'Justice As Process'. They work in groups of 4 or 5. To save time, you could allocate a set of three statements to each group.
- iii. Quickly review some answers to see whether most learners have understood the task.
(Remember, various reasons for problems with 'free' or 'fair' may be offered. Sometimes learners may not find a problem - but their explanation is important. Disagreement may show different emphases, and may raise the question of how to evaluate and relate them: e.g. (a) circumstances or (b) the electoral framework.)

3 Learner Representative Council (LRC)

- i. Ask the groups to move on to Section B where they will reflect on their school's Learners' Representative Council electoral process.
- ii. Again, take some quick feedback on this.

4 Conclusion

You might conclude by inviting learners to look again at Column D on their 'Mapping Society' resource handed out in Lesson 1. Some aspects illustrative of constitutional democracy as found in South Africa are listed here.

OTHER IDEAS

5 For Further Reflection

Section C of the Lesson Materials page 'Justice As Process' consists of ideas for discussion – and moves into a broader consideration of democracy. Faster groups might be able to take a quick look at this. Or, you could invite learners to consider this section on their own, or perhaps as a homework discussion with a friend.

6 Subsidiarity

Subsidiarity is an important concept in Catholic social teaching. When considering issues such as decision-making, representivity, and democracy (particularly with regard to local government or the role of the LRC), you might like to keep the term *subsidiarity* in mind. According to this principle:

'... social bodies exist for the sake of the person, so that what individuals are able to do, societies should not assume, and what smaller societies can do, larger societies should not take over.'

(JA Komonchak, M Collins, and DA Lane. 1987. *The New Dictionary of Theology*. Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, p 986)

7 False Assumptions About Politics

Instead of focusing on a particular issue, such as elections, you might like to involve the learners in thinking critically about the following ten assumptions spelt out in *CORD*, p 403-405.

- (1) The assumption that political indifference in politics means political neutrality
- (2) The assumption that Religion has no business in Politics
- (3) The assumption that political protest/dissent is 'unpatriotic'
- (4) The assumption that what is illegal is necessarily immoral
- (5) The assumption that a particular viewpoint (or organisation) has the monopoly of truth
- (6) The assumption that political slogans express moral 'musts'
- (7) The assumption that political rhetoric is straight-talk
- (8) The assumption that it's acceptable to make political decisions for other people provided that "it's for their benefit"
- (9) The assumption that we're politically okay because "things are far worse" somewhere else
- (10) The assumption that I have no responsibility for a wrong that I didn't cause.

MATERIALS

LEARNER

- CIE. 2005. 'Free and Fair'
- CIE. 2005. 'Justice as Process'



Lesson Materials



Free and Fair

You will have heard the phrase 'free and fair' said in relation to elections. Sometimes an election is only spoken of as 'substantially free and fair'. What is the difference? If all conditions, such as those listed in the table below, are met then the election observers will say that they were 'free and fair'. However, if some conditions were not met, or some irregularities observed, then the election process may be described as 'flawed'. But if these 'flaws' are viewed as not likely to affect the overall result then observers may say that the elections were 'substantially free and fair'.

	'Free'	'Fair'
Before polling day	Freedom of movement Freedom of speech (for candidates, the media, voters and others) Freedom of assembly Freedom of association Freedom from fear in connection with the election and the campaign Absence of impediments to standing for election (for both parties and independent candidates) Equal and universal suffrage	A transparent electoral process An election act and an election system that grant no special privileges to any political party or social group Absence of impediments to inclusion in the electoral register Establishment of an independent and impartial election commission Impartial treatment of candidates by the police, the army and the courts of law Equal opportunities for political parties and independent candidates to stand for election Impartial voter education programs An orderly election campaign (observance of a code of conduct) Equal access to publicly controlled media Impartial allotment of public funds to political parties (if relevant) No misuse of government facilities for campaign purposes

On polling day/...

Lesson Materials
 FREE AND FAIR (cont)



<p>On polling day</p>	<p>Opportunity to participate in the election</p>	<p>Access to all polling stations for representatives of the political parties, accredited local and international observers, and the media Secrecy of ballot Absence of intimidation of voters Effective design of ballot papers Proper ballot boxes Impartial assistance to voters (if necessary) Proper counting procedures Proper treatment of void ballot papers Proper precautionary measures when transporting election materials Impartial protection of polling stations</p>
<p>After polling day</p>	<p>Legal possibilities of complaint</p>	<p>Official and expeditious announcements of election results Impartial treatment of any election results by the media Acceptance of the election results by everyone involved</p>

This table is taken from J Elklitt and P Svenssen, 'The Rise of Election Monitoring: What Makes Elections Free and Fair?' *Journal of Democracy*, Vol. 8, No. 3 (July 1997), pp. 32-46.

Lesson Materials

Justice as Process

Introduction

- South Africa is a constitutional democracy. If you are under 18 you will not have voted in a national election. However, you have probably voted for your school's Learners' Representative Council. All schools, whether public or independent, are required by the South African Schools Act to have Learner Representative Councils. This is one way of giving you a direct experience of democracy and democratic processes - and forms part of an effort to strengthen democracy at all levels of our society.
Does your school have a LRC?
- National elections are set up and run by the Independent Electoral Commission (a statutory body defined in Chapter 9 of the South African Constitution). The IEC's task is to deliver an electoral process that can be described as 'free and fair'. In your school, is there a clear LRC electoral process? Who oversees it? What steps are taken to ensure that these elections are 'free and fair'?
- Look at the table in your Materials Page 'Free and Fair' Use this to help you answer the questions in Sections A & B below.

Section A: A lighter look at Learner Representative Council electoral processes at St Elsewhere's

1. Imagine you are invited to be LRC election observers at St Elsewhere's, a school one hopes is nowhere to be found in South Africa. (The school motto is, incidentally, 'Do as I say; not as I do'. And, while its Grade 12 results are dreadful, learners are promised 'Pie-in-the-sky-when-you-die': the school badge shows a glittering prize sitting comfortably on a fluffy white cloud on a sky-blue background.) These statements describe things that you see during the election process. Look quickly at each statement and evaluate it: Does it meet the criteria of 'free'? Does it meet the criteria of 'fair'? Why not? Use the table to help you identify how either or both 'freeness' and 'fairness' may be violated.
 - a) Only learners in proper school uniform may vote.
 - b) Only learners who have paid-up school fees may stand for election.
 - c) All election posters must be the same size and made on a computer.
 - d) The old SRC counts the votes.
 - e) The results are announced after the teachers have seen and approved them.
 - f) One candidate (a difficult person) didn't get enough votes to make it onto the SRC and won't accept the results - but those who ran the electoral process say the election is over and the results are now public.
 - g) On the day of the elections most teachers excuse themselves saying they have urgent things to do
 - h) The library monitors help photocopy the ballot papers.

i)/...

Lesson Materials

JUSTICE AS PROCESS (cont)

- i) Grades 8-10 are allowed one candidate per class; Grades 11-12 are allowed two candidates per class.
- j) Only the Grade 11 candidates are allowed to make speeches at assembly.
- k) A teacher keeps telling her/his class who s/he would like to see elected.
- l) Only learners with clean discipline records may stand for election.
- m) Friends of one or two of the candidates are in charge of the voting process.
- n) The election day clashes with a Girls Under 16 netball tournament and team members and some supporters have to leave before the voting process starts.
- o) Observers aren't allowed to see the ballots being counted; the teacher who manages this process and who selects the counting team says 'You can trust us.'

Section B: More seriously - reflecting on the LRC electoral process in your own school

2. How could you / do you avoid situations like those listed above from arising in your own school? Quickly discuss one or more of these elements of an electoral process in relation to your school practice (which may also include a policy or charter document). It may be that these things are being done well. It may be that there is room for improvement. Affirm what is being done well. If you do suggest improvements, try to make them practical - they should enhance the process by contributing to 'freeness' and 'fairness'. Shape your discussion by considering:
 - a) What does your school do? Name one or two things, in your view, that work well. Identify one or two things that you think could be done better.
 - b) How is what will happen explained / made known to all?
 - c) Is it clear who may stand and how the electoral process will be run?
 - d) Is it clear how offices are allocated and what is expected of those elected?
 - e) How is impartiality in the *pre-*, *during*, and *after-* election process upheld?
 - f) How are disputes dealt with?
 - g) Under what circumstances may an elected member of the LRC be removed from office?
3. Does your school have a document (constitution or charter) that sets covers the aspects of an LRC election process touched on in 2a-g above? How was it drawn up? By what process was it accepted? Are there procedures for making changes when required? Are any needed? Do you have easy access to this document?
4. If the school does not have a written LRC constitution, or has one that needs revision, suggest what it should contain, who should work on it, and how it should be adopted.

Section C/...

Lesson Materials 
JUSTICE AS PROCESS (cont)

Section C: Further issues concerning democratic forms and processes
(Optional)

5. Thinking about democracy in Africa

- Two common types of democracy are the constituency-based system and the system of proportional representation. Can you name an African country for each type? Are you aware of the differences, and strengths and weaknesses of each system?
- Name some African countries which have recently had (substantially) free and fair elections?
- Name an African country where progress towards democracy is being made? On what do you base your judgement?
- Are there any countries in Africa where democratic processes are under threat? On what do you base your judgement?
- Can you think of a situation where a party does not enter into an electoral process or does not accept the results of an election? Why might they do this? What consequences might follow for the country concerned? How might this situation be addressed? (Think both internally, and externally - i.e. the role of neighbouring countries, the African Union, and so on.)

6. Does democracy have any limits? Are there any alternatives?

- Are there any limits to democracy?
- Have you ever experienced a consensus-building process - a way of getting agreement, through discussion, without voting? (In some circumstances voting may be divisive - a majority might ride roughshod over a minority. Can you think of an example?) It's possible to see the negotiations leading up to South Africa's first democratic elections in 1994 as a consensus-building activity on a large scale. The interim and final Constitutions were also developed during the course of this process. Once sufficient agreement between the parties had been reached, the electoral process could go ahead. What might the strengths of consensus-building be? Can you think of possible difficulties with this process?

LESSON 26: Society, Education and the State



REFERENCE

Page 405 [DEVELOPMENT OF CRITICAL THINKING]



WHAT YOU NEED

- (1) LSM: 'Society, Education, and the State'
- (1) LSM: 'Mapping Society' (Lesson 24)

AIM

- To consider the social role of education, the role of the state in regulating and providing education, and the concept of the right to education

OUTCOMES

- KUI Learners understand the state's role in education.

CLASSROOM QUOTES

'Everyone has the right to a basic education, including adult basic education.'

(South African Constitution, Section 29(1)(a), Act 108 of 1996)

TEACHER'S NOTE

BACKGROUND

All social institutions need some form of education – it's how their members learn the roles they will play in these institutions and in wider society. However, in our age, the school has become the most widespread form of education with the complex tasks of developing each learner's individual potential while equipping learners to be citizens and to find work. We now think of education as a right and look to the state to be the major provider with regard to schools. However, those of us fortunate to have access to education need to remember that this idea of 'universal access' to education, and the major responsibility for this on the part of the state to provide at least primary schooling, are relatively new – a little over 12 decades or so in parts of Europe and somewhat less everywhere else. Before this, in the West, and in colonial contexts, it was often the Church – Protestant and Catholic – that set up schools that gave broader access to education. In South Africa, many liberation leaders received their education in mission schools. Some schools, such as Lovedale in the Eastern Cape (in what was then the Cape Colony) set high standards (at least in the early years). Indeed, children of white settlers had to go back to England, Scotland, or elsewhere in Europe to receive a comparable education. To provide local access to quality education for white children was, in fact, a key reason for the establishment of Bishops, a well-known school for boys in Cape Town. However, even today, in many poorer countries universal access to education is not available to all. Thus, as you have seen, Millennium Goals 2 & 3 aspire to this: to 'achieve universal primary education' by ensuring that all boys and girls complete a full course of primary schooling' and 'to promote gender equality and empower women,' which includes eliminating 'gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and at all levels by 2015.'

If we relate this to justice, then you will see that education is both a human right and for the common good. Equality is found (theoretically at least) in ‘universal access’ to all through the state system of education. (In many countries, private schools still exist alongside the public system for those who can afford them.) The concern for equity can be seen in the effort to transform education and to provide more funding and better resources to historically disadvantaged schools. How equity relates to broader business and economic concerns can be seen in the efforts to increase the numbers of learners and especially of girls taking Mathematics and Science up to Grade 12. It can also be seen in inclusion policies for disabled people.

However, another aspect of justice with regard to education is utility – related to ability and perhaps easier understood through this phrase from the preamble to the constitution: ‘to free the potential of each person’. In other words, justice as equality can’t be about reducing everyone to ‘sameness’ – equality can be about basic access and a measure of equality of opportunity – but justice for each individual also requires the system to take their individuality and their individual ability seriously.

Very practical encounters with the tension between equality, equity, and utility/ability are faced on a daily basis by teachers. This includes deciding on which level to pitch the lesson for any given class, or how teachers distribute their time and attention across the class so that all learners – whether weaker or more able, whether boys or girls – can successfully be drawn into the lesson activities, and so on. And in the Revised National Curriculum Statement, teachers are also asked to be sensitive to the different learning needs and learning styles among learners.

LESSON OUTLINE

1 Introduction

Hand out the Lesson Materials page ‘Society, Education, and the State’ Note – in case you need to explain this – that the first column of the table teases out the family – community – wider society categories of the ‘Mapping Society’ resource with regard to a particular issue: education. The learners will be doing three tasks:

- Section A asks learners to identify a wide range of educational settings;
- Section B asks them to reflect on their own experience of school; and
- Section C asks them to look at justice in relation to education and the role of the state in this regard.

2 Identifying and Mapping

Ask the learners as individual, in pairs, or in small groups to complete the table in Section A. When you take feedback, see if the learners have been able to see how the educational activities are linked with the particular needs of the institution concerned. These needs may be ‘social’ (i.e. integration into a community through working together with others as a harmonious unit – e.g. family or community), civil (e.g. related to rights or responsibilities of citizenship), or ‘economic’ in orientation (e.g. necessary skills to keep machinery working, or vocational education, etc.). While this focus is on the institutional needs, some learners may also raise the issue of their own educational aspirations.

3 Reflecting

Let the learners answer the questions in Sections B and C. When taking feedback, see whether values or different forms of justice feature in the discussions. Look for the opportunity to introduce or consolidate the understanding of learners for such terms as equality, equity, access, inclusion, individual ability, and differentiation.

OTHER IDEAS

4 Building Awareness

This is something you and your colleagues, with the help of successive classes of learners, could begin to work on over a period of a few years.

- Build awareness of the educational vision and work of Catholic religious congregations, and their founders, who have set up schools – particularly schools for girls (as with Saint Angela Merici, 1474-1540) and free schools for poor boys (as with Saint John Baptist de La Salle, 1651-1719). These initiatives were taken before state systems of education came into existence – and these, themselves, took time to move towards providing universal access to education for both boys and girls.
- Share the story of your school with those of your closest neighbouring Catholic schools. Build up an awareness of the early and ongoing work of two or three of the following congregations in South Africa: Assumption Sisters, Loreto Sisters, Notre Dame Sisters, the various congregations of Dominican Sisters, the Marist Brothers, De La Salle Brothers, Salesians (with various technical and vocational projects that help young people bridge from school to work), and so on. Think, too, of the Diocesan schools and of the work of local congregations, or of pioneering institutions such as Boys' Town. Include the feast days of importance to the Catholic schools you have a close relationship with in your school calendar.
- When investigating the education work of a congregation, look for the differences and resonances with education in our own time. Look, too, for significant contributions or innovations with lasting legacies made by them in education. In this regard, you might like to look at an article by John Mc Cormick, 'Catholic Education and Saint John Baptist de La Salle: Resonance and Challenge with our own time,' published in Catholic Education News, Vol. 12, Issue 3 (November 2003).
- Become aware of the mission history of your area (place names are often a good clue) and the work of Protestant missionary societies and churches – the Moravians, Congregationalists, Methodists, Anglicans, Dutch Reformed Church, Lutherans, and so on.
- Remember that other faith communities – e.g. Jewish, Hindu, and Muslim – have also been involved in education. Are you aware of any of their schools? Do you know of any ongoing work in education on the part of these communities in your area?
- Perhaps you or your learners have relatives who might be able to speak of their experience of education – mission schools, 'Bantu Education', June 1976 and the country wide waves of protest that followed, involvement with organisations such as COSAS or teacher unions such as SADTU, or even their experience of education in exile – The Solomon Mahlangu Freedom College (SAMAFSCO) or other institutions.

MATERIALS

LEARNER

- CIE. 2005. 'Society, Education, and the State'



Lesson Materials



Society, Education and the State

Section A: Identifying and mapping various social forms and sites of education

Perhaps you've got more familiar with how the social matrix works. In this activity, you'll apply it in a slightly different way, using the table below. You will be mapping different forms of education in relation to the 'institutional site of educational activity' and considering:

- What does education mean for each?
- What shape does it assume?
- What purposes is it expected to fulfil?

Fill in the table. Some examples have been provided. But add others you know of. And, if necessary, for instance with regard to your faith community, provide new examples from your experience. Provide at least one social / organisational purpose for each item listed in column 2.

INSTITUTIONAL SITE OF EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY	THE FORM / SHAPE OF THE EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY	THE SOCIAL / ORGANISATIONAL PURPOSE FOR THE EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY
Family	Household skills – often gendered (i.e. a distinction between tasks carried out by boys / men and girls / women)	
'Traditional, kinship-based community	Initiation schools	
Faith-based community – i.e. the Catholic church	Catechesis Bible study groups Formation – through an organisation such as Young Christian students The Catholic school (whether a public school on private property or an independent school) Other? Or, apply this to your faith community.	Induction into the community of faith

Workplace related/...

Lesson Materials



SOCIETY, EDUCATION, AND THE STATE (cont)

INSTITUTIONAL SITE OF EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY	THE FORM / SHAPE OF THE EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY	THE SOCIAL / ORGANISATIONAL PURPOSE FOR THE EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY
Workplace related – a trade union	Short courses run by trade unions or labour NGOs. Or, mentoring from more experienced union members	Informing workers of their rights, grievance procedures, procedures for declaring a dispute, ways of conducting
Workplace related – a manufacturing business	On the job instruction in how to use machinery	
Workplace related – a profession		
State system of education	The public school Regulatory framework for the independent school	

Section B: Reflecting on your experience of school-based education

- (1) Do you like school?
- (2) Who decided you would attend this school? Why?
- (3) Is your school public or independent?
- (4) What curriculum is on offer? (What subject choices are available to you?)
- (5) What do you think about education being compulsory?
- (6) Think of your (extended) family. What educational opportunities were available to your parents and grandparents?
- (7) What do your parents hope for from your education?
- (8) What do you hope for from your education?
- (9) What does the state hope for from your education?
- (10) If your school is a Catholic school, do you think this makes a difference? What? Why?

Section C/...

Lesson Materials

SOCIETY, EDUCATION, AND THE STATE (cont)

Section C: Reflecting on Education and the role of the State

Read through the material in the two bullet points and answer the questions that follow.

- The preamble to the South African Constitution says that the aim of the Constitution is to:
 - 'Heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights;
 - Lay the foundations for a democratic and open society in which government is based on the will of the people and every citizen is equally protected by law;
 - Improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person; and
 - Build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations.'
 - 'Everyone has the right to a basic education, including adult basic education.' (South African Constitution, Section 29(1)(a), Act 108 of 1996).
- (1) What do you understand by the right to education?
 - (2) What does the South African state understand by the right to education? What limits are placed on this? Why?
 - (3) Name ways in which your experience of education may link with the preamble quoted above (i.e. the promotion of 'democratic values', 'social justice', improvement of 'the quality of lives of all citizens', and the freeing of 'the potential of each person').
 - (4) Can you suggest why the education sector is divided into 'public' and 'private'?
 - (5) What strengths might arise from having both? What difficulties are posed, in South Africa, by having both? What role does the state play with regard to both?

LESSON 27: Experiencing Justice as the Reign of God



REFERENCE

Page 405-406 [GUIDANCE:
Acquaintance with THE CHURCH'S
LIVING TRADITION]



WHAT YOU NEED

- (2) LSM: 'The Reign of God'
- (2) (3) (4) LSM: 'Mapping Society' (Lesson 24)

AIM

- To help learners discover the presence of God's reign in their daily lives through considering the words of members of a small Bible study group

OUTCOMES

- KUI Learners identify where God's reign might be experienced in their own lives.

CLASSROOM QUOTE

'... your kingdom come, / your will be done, / on earth as it is in heaven...' [Matthew 6:10]

TEACHER'S NOTE

In the previous lesson, the See-Judge-Act method was introduced. However, the idea of God's *basileia* / reign / kingdom / kin-dom needs more exploration. Here, learners will do this through exploring the words of members of a bible study group who met between June 1988 and December 1992 in Amawoti. Amawoti, then, was an 'informal settlement' outside Durban. It was, like many other informal settlements around the country, a sign of rapid urbanisation. Some 50%, maybe slightly more, of the inhabitants of a city such as Durban live in informal settlements of this nature - so, in many respects, this is the norm for cities: *not* high-rise flats or suburbs, with electricity, water, refuse removal, and water-borne sewerage. In addition to poverty, these were late apartheid years - there was conflict in the community between the United Democratic Front and Inkatha; harassment, arrest, and detention, particularly for UDF youth members, at the hands of the police and army.

The quotes used are from transcriptions of some of these bible studies. Sometimes, the contributions of two or three members have been condensed into key phrases and grouped together. These were young people, some whose lives were in danger. They were estranged from the church but wanted to know how they might recognise the work of God in their lives. They were not trained readers of the Bible or theologians - just ordinary people following a study process agreed to by the group, with a minimum of scholarly input, who met to discuss Bible passages that focused on God's *basileia*. When these Bible studies began, a state of emergency was in force. As the studies continued, this was lifted, political parties unbanned, political prisoners released, and many in exile returned. The negotiated transition of South Africa from an apartheid state to the constitutional democracy we have today was started. The studies speak of the suffering, repression, and hope of these times.

The 'Mapping Society' matrix of Lesson 1 may be useful in the lesson: co-ordinates particularly helpful include: D1-5; 4A-D; 5A-D.

BACKGROUND

That people live in such circumstances shows us that people and structures 'have got in the way of God'. But we must distinguish between poverty as socio-economic deprivation and the resilience - expressed through culture and faith - of the poor. We must see the injustice of these circumstances while recognising people's dignity and ability to find signs of life and to live - a tenacity, courage, and endurance that should humble those of us who are socio-economically better off.

Have things changed in Amawoti, or places like this, since the advent of constitutional democracy in South Africa? Some settlements have been upgraded - provision of roads, access to water and electricity, the building of Reconstruction and Development houses, the commitment to developing schools, the building of clinics. 'Wall to wall' municipalities ensure that no settlement - town or village - is left out: all have the opportunity to set priorities for development in their communities. But development still comes slowly to some places - perhaps Amawoti has not yet benefited. And, sometimes when it comes the blessing is mixed: free water and electricity are limited (and sometimes not yet available); when people can't pay, cut-offs follow. So, we see the rise of civic organisations again - like the Soweto Electricity Crisis Committee - and sometimes a violence born of frustration with inefficient or corrupt town managements. And sometimes settlements are too new for the government's development plans to have caught up with them.

Some words are needed about this cluster: God's basileia / reign / kingdom / kin-dom. The Greek New Testament term basileia is usually translated as 'God's Kingdom'. While the Bible study group members use masculine pronouns when speaking of God, Philpott has preferred to speak of God's kin-dom. By leaving out the 'g', he is trying to signal a distance from a male monarchical concept of God's reign and, simultaneously, highlight the inclusive nature of God's family - i.e. all are God's kin (relatives). What do you think of his suggestion? At any rate, what is important is that God's empire is nothing like the Roman empire, the other empires of history, or South Africa's own colonial and apartheid past - and this is the good news (i.e. the Gospel): that God's empire can be present to us in our lives - we need faith to see this - but that it's very partiality (think of the parable that tells of the intermingling of weeds and wheat) requires us again and again to choose - to choose life, to bring life to others, even in simple, small, apparently insignificant ways.

Perhaps you recall Sipho's quote from the first lesson of this unit: 'If some people don't have their basic needs, does it mean that other people have got in the way of God?' Constitutional democracy, the social welfare and development programmes of government, together with the subsidiarity of local government structures, have, perhaps, removed some obstacles that 'have got in the way of God' - but it's clear that much more, by all of us, at all levels of our society, still needs to be done.

LESSON OUTLINE

I Introduction

Start by referring to the See-Judge-Act method of social analysis dealt with in the previous lesson. Explain that in this lesson the focus is on the vision aspect of the JUDGE stage – i.e. on God's *basileia* / reign / kingdom / kin-dom. Suggest that what God wants for all people is not all far away. It can be close to us, we can experience it – even if in fleeting, or ambiguous ways in

our daily lives. Whenever we experience something of what God wants for all people Christians can say that this is the experience of God's *basileia* / reign / kingdom / kin-dom.

2 Amawoti

Distribute the Lesson Materials page 'The Reign of God'. Let the learners do Section A: 'Amawoti ... then and now'. Then, review this with them. Use some of the details in the Teacher's Note to bring out both historical and socio-economic circumstances of informal settlements like that of Amawoti. Link it with the SEE stage.

3 The Reign of God in Amawoti

Let the learners do Section B: 'Where the Reign of God in Amawoti is seen'. Link it with JUDGE and ACT stages. Also, if possible, introduce the important qualification on poverty: that socio-economic circumstances can still be countered by the hope and resilience of people, that culture and faith are key resources in this regard.

4 The Reign of God in My Life

Work on Section C: 'Finding the Reign of God in one's own circumstances' can be done by individuals in relation to their own lives. You could also do the exercise in groups or with the whole class. If, for some reason, you decide to continue with group work or to engage the whole class in discussion with regard Section C, then focus on the learners' collective experience of school. Encourage learners, even when things are difficult, to look for signs of resilience, goodness, compassion, work for the common good, and so on.

5 A Closing Prayer

This is given on the Materials page that accompanies this lesson.

OTHER IDEAS

6 About Liberation Theology

The Amawoti group was engaged in an exercise of Liberation Theology, though they would not have called it that. The following points may provide you with an alternative introduction to the lesson.

- 'Liberation' is a new name for 'Salvation': it is about liberation from *all* oppressive forces inside and outside of oneself- and it looks towards God as liberator.
- In a sense, the Liberation Theology movement is about 'liberating' God - letting God be God – letting the Kingdom of God come.
- Liberation Theology was born out of the cry of the poor and the cry of God who identifies with the poorest and the least... to know God is to do justice.
- Liberation Theology is a *way of doing Theology*: it is a process whereby a community analyses and reflects on aspects of its everyday life situation in the light of Scripture (and vice versa) and accordingly plans action together.
- The danger is that it can become reduced to a political secularist messianism – while it includes political liberation, it is not identical with it.

(1991. Michael Burke. 'About Liberation Theology' 192 in *Connections*. Pietermaritzburg: Centaur Publications, p 150-1).

MATERIALS

LEARNER

- CIE. 2005 'The Reign of God'



Lesson Materials

The Reign of God

- In trying to understand what the reign of God is like, the members of the Bible study group in Amawoti asked these questions. Keep them in mind as you read through the answers they came to.

'What and who is it?
Where is it?
When is it coming?
Can we build it?' (pg. 45)

- You will need to use the extracts below to answer the questions in Sections A, B, and C.
 - a) Some phrases members of the group used to describe God's Kin-dom: The kingdom of God is 'God': reign or rule', it is where 'God is busy doing his work', where 'God's power to change is working', it is the 'power of God in action'. It 'starts small and grows'; it is where 'God's project is carried out - where the poor are getting good news, where the captives are being freed, where the blind see.' (p 46 & 160)
 - b) Many in the group concluded that: The kin-dom of God is justice, when soldiers do not favour any side; it is children being well looked after; it is stability (an all-embracing peace, happiness, love, everyone able to satisfy their own needs, no starvation, equality, good relationships); religious unity; sympathy and empathy, with people supporting each other; no apartheid, black and white will be together (people of all races living in Amawoti); no violence (all the weapons will be on fire); animals will be free; people will share the fruit from their trees and all will have enough food; when God is not up there, but down here with the people; the churches are serving the community and uplifting the poor.' (p 64)
 - c) 'It means having our basic needs met. These are the things we need to live; transport or feet; food; love; power; safety or security.' (p 64)
 - d) 'The kin-dom of God - love is part of it; organising people in the community to work together to solve problems; fighting for justice; educating people to love themselves.' (p 65)
 - e) 'It is to do with people. People who: - fight against oppression; / have love; / fight in God's strength; / build people (not things); / identify with the poor and oppressed.' (p 65)

f)/...

Lesson Materials

THE REIGN OF GOD (cont)

- f) 'Jesus' project, the kin-dom of God, brings new life. . . The new life is in the community, not always in the churches. It is happening now. We see new life when: - people have houses; the disabled are accepted into community structures; there is a good relationship between the disabled from Amawoti and the Indians from Phoenix; the community is well organised; people are making a living by using their hands; we need to bring this new life.' (p 66)
- g) 'The church is preaching to people who are oppressed, who are being stepped on by a big boot! The church cannot ignore this struggle against the boot. The struggle and Christianity must go hand in hand.'
- h) 'Jesus came for the rejected and neglected people He came with the answer to their problem
God's kingdom
is where God's project is carried out:
good news is coming to the poor
the oppressed are liberated
is people who build people
In Amawoti, we see God's kingdom when:
the community is organised
they use good ways to meet needs
they make changes
leaders are servants of the community'' (p157)

Section A: Amawoti - or similar communities - then and now

1. Look at these passages - particularly (b), (e), and (g) - and see what you can discover about life in Amawoti. Where do you think Amawoti is? When do you think these things were said? What was daily life like then? What difficulties did the community in Amawoti (or similar communities) have then? Can you suggest why?
2. What do you think the speaker meant by the 'big boot' (g) then? What might we identify with the 'big boot' today?
3. What sort of things **might** have changed for communities like Amawoti since 1992? What challenges might remain? Can you think of any new difficulties that may face communities like this? Can you suggest why?

Section B: Where the Reign of God in Amawoti is seen

4. What do the bible study members say about the reign of God in Amawoti. Where do they see it? How is it understood?

5./...

Lesson Materials

THE REIGN OF GOD (cont)

5. What do you think of this view of God's reign in Amawoti? Do you agree with it? Can you think of any difficulties with it?
6. What do you think about statements like: 'The new life is in the community, not always in the churches.' Do you think this is true? Why? Why not? (Does it suggest anything about how Christians and those of other faiths or no faith at all might work together for justice? Or, for the common good?)
7. Even though the members of the Amawoti bible study group are estranged from the church, there are echoes from other texts in the bible other than the specific one they are studying in their comments. Can you recognise any?

Section C: Finding the Reign of God in one's own circumstances

If your life is difficult, think about Father Cardijn's comment that there is always more good in any situation than evil -that the challenge is to identify the good because we see the evil more easily. Remember, he wasn't talking lightly: he was talking to workers your age, who, if they could find work, were often working in dangerous, strenuous, low-paid work, where abuse by bosses, accidents, and even occupational disease was common.

8. Think about your own life circumstances. Where do you live? Compare / contrast this what you can glean about Amawoti.
9. Where do you see or experience the reign of God - as suggested by the bible study members - in your life: family, school, community, wider society? Try to be specific. Name signs of resilience, life, and hope. If you are from a different faith background, ask what God would will for all people and consider where you experience this in your own life. What common ground or agreement is present in the answers of those of different faiths? Write this up as a personal statement or creed.
10. What does 'they use good ways to meet needs' suggest about how to work co-operatively with God on God's project? What 'good ways' can you name?

Closing Prayer

God of Justice, God of Love, you sent your Son to live in solidarity with human beings - particularly those who were poor, needing healing, wanting liberation from empire, women, and children; and who challenged the wealthy and the religious of his day. You sent your Holy Spirit to live in us, to sustain us, to give us courage in our work, with you, of making earth like heaven. We realise that we live in a field of both weeds and wheat. Help us to be found among the wheat - life giving and not death-dealing in our relations with others. Help us to be as light, salt, or leaven according to what is needed at any time. Help us to find hope in the resilience of others, to take courage from the myriad ways in which, somehow, people find the strength to carry on with life. Amen.

LESSON 28: Justice for All



REFERENCE

Page 407 [ACTION & SERVICE: Relief Work]



WHAT YOU NEED

- (1) LSM: 'Pursuing Justice'

AIM

- To review what has been learnt about justice by exploring tensions between different principles involved in making just decisions
-

OUTCOMES

- KUI Learners demonstrate their understanding of justice by applying key justice terms to various scenarios.
 - DAP Learners identify and value some things that can be done to improve the practice of justice in their own lives.
-

CLASSROOM QUOTES

‘Justice is conscience, not a personal conscience but the conscience of the whole of humanity. Those who clearly recognize the voice of their own conscience usually recognize also the voice of justice.’ (Alexander Solzhenitsyn)

TEACHER'S NOTE

The scenarios on the Lesson materials page allow learners to review aspects of what they have learnt or come across during the previous lessons in this unit. If you recall, the unit began by asking what basic human needs are, and it established as one key criterion that societies are just societies only to the extent that all their members can access these. Thus, human rights are not only about civil and political rights, but socio-economic and cultural rights as well. When looking at the role of the state, justice as development was introduced. In addition, the preamble of the Constitution brought out the strong theme of equity/redress for all who had experienced forms of disadvantage and exclusion under colonialism/segregation/apartheid – ‘black’, ‘coloured’, and ‘Indian’ people; women (across class, but particularly ‘black’ women); those with impairments (across class). The Constitution also commits government to progressively realising socio-economic rights – and social grants, building of houses, and allocations of free water and electricity go some way towards this. But the big challenge is to create large numbers of jobs so that people can find adequately paid employment.

What the scenarios try to do is show that justice requires a selection of principles appropriate to a particular situation. Take ‘justice’ as ‘fairness’. Are we concerned with ‘equity’ or ‘equality’? Or with ‘utility’ or the development of ‘individual potential/talent’? Or with due process? What is fair or just is understood differently depending on the issue and which concepts are invoked to address it. The use of word-strings is an attempt to help learners see this. They show that while

justice in the abstract touches all kinds of principles, in particular situations some principles are more relevant/need to be chosen/need to be upheld in relation to that situation – even as this highlights tensions between principles. For example, some suggested word-strings are:

Scenario 1: Justice-fairness-equality-due process

Scenario 2: Justice-inclusion-access-equity-governance

Scenario 5: Justice-development-common good-subsidiarity

BACKGROUND

However, justice, in all its forms, concerns relationships and, for social issues, requires collective organisation. So, institutions ranging from the family to the state need to look at themselves. Do they work in ways respectful of human dignity? Do they follow due process? Do they strive to be inclusive and to allow individuals to develop their potential? Do they practice good governance? Do they allow for participation in decision-making by those who will benefit or be affected by policies or projects? These questions show that all of us can be directly involved in acts of justice (or injustice) during the course of our daily lives.

A further word on impairment is necessary, particularly since space precludes doing more than touching on this in one of the scenarios in this lesson. Impairment may be sensory, cognitive, or physical and refers to degrees of limitation of function (e.g. partial sight/hearing or total deafness/blindness). It may be inherited as a congenital condition (e.g. cerebral palsy), brought about through disease (e.g. paralysis), or caused by injury / trauma (e.g. the loss of movement or a limb). The challenge for all of us – those with an impairment and ourselves – is to find ways to address, manage, and minimise the effects of the impairment. The level of disability determines how much we are able to do about it. For example, an eye impairment may be corrected with glasses; a wheelchair and appropriate building design can enhance mobility and access. (Did you know that all public buildings are supposed to provide for this and that government must progressively implement this? And that this includes public schools? Also, that government includes ‘disability’ as a category in its employment equity targets? Or that government makes a ‘disability grant’ available?) Equity, access, and inclusion are the justice terms usually associated with making society more responsive to the needs of those with one or other impairment.

A major difficulty – although not often stated as such – is simply the resources available, which very quickly introduces cost implications. (This is why the state has to show progressive realisation of socio-economic rights for instance.) Thus, equality may appear cheaper from a limited angle of vision than equity, or developing individual potential or providing a range of opportunities to meet individual talents (both of these are sometimes viewed under utility). Another tension, which has not been explored is how equity can lead to resentment among those who previously enjoyed some advantage over others.

A third critical issue, which two scenarios touch on – but which this unit has not had the space to deal with – concerns sustainable development. (An aspect of this is environmental rehabilitation – think of the ‘Work for Water’ project which, among other things, seeks to remove water-hungry alien vegetation from sensitive ecological areas such as ‘sponge areas’.) But sometimes it’s hard to balance environmental concerns against developmental concerns, particularly when jobs are so desperately needed.

However, it is important for all of us to ask: What kind of society do we want? How are we going to move in that direction? And, to answer for ourselves: What sort of contribution can each of us make?

LESSON OUTLINE

1 Introduction

Hand out the Lesson Materials Page 'Pursuing Justice'. Tell the learners that this lesson provides an opportunity to review ideas about justice that they will have touched on or explored in the previous lessons of this unit. Briefly run through the terms listed in the introduction of the page. (Focus only on those the learners are likely to need in this lesson for their word-strings.)

2 The First Scenario

Ask everyone, individually or in groups to do the first scenario. Take some feedback and elicit a collective word-string on this scenario.

3 Other Scenarios

Then, assign a different scenario to each group so that all will be covered by the class. Groups that work faster can choose another to look at if they have time. Monitor the group discussions. Assist where needed.

4 Feedback and Discussion

Decide, based on what you hear, which of these scenarios will best serve for some feedback (from the group) and a short (stimulating) class discussion.

5 Concluding Remarks

Remind learners that questions of justice are not far away, but are at hand, part of our daily lives, and that we need to look for what each of us can do, even as we look at the larger issues and the longer term.

6 Closing Reflection

Invite them to reflect on Deuteronomy 16:20: 'Justice and justice alone you shall pursue, that you may have life and may possess the land which the Lord, your God, is giving you.' If it's possible, this could be done quietly. Learners could be asked to reflect on what this text might say to them. Those from faiths other than Christian or who profess no faith at all can still consider what this text might say to them. They could list some things they can do in their everyday lives.

OTHER IDEAS

7 Homework Exercise

You could reserve one of the scenarios as a homework exercise.

MATERIALS

LEARNER

- CIE. 2005. 'Pursuing Justice'



Lesson Materials

Pursuing Justice

INTRODUCTION

Consider these scenarios. In your responses to the questions that accompany each of them, you will need to consider various key words/concepts linked to justice. You will have touched on many of these in this unit. Here is a list to which you can add if you like:

Justice fairness equity equality due process utility restorative justice consistency sustainability access inclusion common good subsidiarity rule of law redress distributive justice human dignity human rights participation consultation custom representivity affirmative action good governance diversity accountability legislation policy

In each scenario you are asked to create a 'word-string'. Do this by choosing three to five terms that most describe the justice issue of each particular case. For example:

Justice-fairness-equity-inclusion-access-human dignity...

Justice-fairness-equality-human rights...

Justice-fairness-due process-good governance...

As you can see, each accentuates a different set of principles which may be chosen because of the particular issue at hand. So, justice requires the contextual selection and application of principles. This will be reflected in the way you order your selected terms. Although there is not one way of doing this, you should give some consideration to your sequencing.

Scenario 1: Radical equality

Learners in a hostel notice that because the building is rectangular that the corner rooms have two windows and are slightly larger than other rooms which only have one window. Many learners would like to have a corner room but only eight are available – it's a double storey. (A couple of years ago, the rooms used to be assigned to prefects by the warden, but now the school has an LRC.) After much argument, it is agreed: all rooms will be allocated by lot. All the learners who will live in that hostel for that year will place their names in one box. The room numbers will be placed in another box. In front of everyone, the warden will take one piece paper from each box – and, thus, each student will get a room.

What used to happen? How would you describe the system in place then? Can you explain what would be needed to see it as 'just'? What has changed? Why is it an issue now? Why do the LRC members not just get the rooms? (Do you think they should?) Why is drawing rooms by lot acceptable to all? Do you think that all – the warden, different groupings of learners - involved have the same reasons / motives for accepting this solution? What

advantages/...

Lesson Materials

PURSUING JUSTICE (cont)

advantages does it have? What forms of justice does it satisfy? Can you think of any limitations? Carefully explain why we don't choose our presidents or members of parliament this way. (What might happen if we did? What would happen to politics as we know it? What does 'party politics' allow for?) Create a word-string that describes the concept of justice at work here.

📖 Scenario 2: Equity and access

Thembisile arrives, in a wheelchair, at your school as a new learner in Grade 8.

What practical arrangements could be made to accommodate her? What alterations might be needed to existing buildings to increase access for learners like Thembisile?

Alterations to existing buildings may be too costly to do immediately. And, at present, Thembisile is the only learner in a wheelchair. But the school is planning to build two new classrooms and some new toilet facilities for learners.

What sorts of things should be taken into account when the plans are drawn up to increase wheelchair access? Create a word-string that illustrates the responsibility of the school with regard to this situation.

📖 Scenario 3: A conflict of interests

For many years, only a small portion of relatively flat land on a farm has been under cultivation. The larger, hilly bushveld area has largely been left, apart from some hunting – occasionally by the owner and visitors; seasonally by tenants who have hunting dogs. But eco-tourism has become popular in the area. If the hunting is stopped, and the cutting down of firewood prevented, then it may be possible to develop a bush camp for eco-tourism. The land owner is happy with this idea – and sees this vision as part of the government's attempts to encourage tourism and sustainable, environmentally sound, development. The tenants are furious. Why?

Create a word-string that might support the farmer's position. Create a word-string that might support the tenants' perspective. Carefully, suggest why the farm owner might be surprised by the response of the tenant-workers. (Think about SA history, as well as about the role of power in relationships between owners and workers.)

📖 Scenario 4: Criminal Rights?

Someone you know was the victim of a robbery. The thief was caught. But during the trial, the defence attorney is able to establish that the police used threats and overstepped legal bounds in their investigation. The magistrate says that this behaviour has compromised the case by tainting the evidence and dismisses the case. Your friend feels angry and complains to you that it seems that criminals have more rights than decent citizens. Some people say that it's useless to trust

the police/...

Lesson Materials

PURSUIING JUSTICE (cont)

the police and courts for justice – next time they'll see to it that criminals don't get away with it.

If you or someone you know has had an experience like this then it may be difficult to explore these questions. However, in what way might the magistrate's decision be viewed as just? Create a word-string to support this. Can you see why a decision like this is for the good of all law-abiding citizens like yourself? What are the dangers when a group of people 'take the law into their own hands'? What advantages might a court process have over vigilantism? Why is it not true to say that 'criminals have more rights than decent citizens'? What can be done by police and communities to develop trust?

Scenario 5: Just development?

Early in the new democracy the Department of Water Affairs and Forestry is keen to do its bit to alleviate poverty in rural areas. A project to provide remote villages with a safe, clean, dependable water supply is initiated in the Lusikisiki area of the Eastern Cape. One village is near a stream that only flows during the rainy season. For much of the year villagers fetch their water from shrinking muddy pools which sometimes do not last until the next rains. An engineer designs and builds a system that brings fresh spring water over a distance of five kilometres to the village. He says, proudly, that the village now has better water than Durban. (It's natural spring water and doesn't need purification.) The department, too, is happy: the project links nicely with government's commitment to (what we now call) MDG 7 and the ideal of creating government – community partnerships. The department's plan is to provide the infrastructure and then make the community responsible for maintaining it. However, to do this, the community decides that all villagers must pay a small tariff for their clean water. This will fund any necessary repairs. Both the government and the community hope that most of these repairs can be done by members of the community. In this way, the community will 'own' the system and want to look after it – and some members of the community will benefit by being paid to carry out the repairs. It seems like a model of government - community partnership. So, the Minister of Water Affairs and Forestry flies in by helicopter to the village for the official opening. While the minister is in the village he is surprised to see an elderly woman collecting muddy water from a pool in the river bed. He asks why this is so and is angered by what he's told: This person is too poor to pay the tariff and so is not allowed to use the good, clean water supply.

What was government hoping for when this program was designed? Create a word string to describe this. What do you think government did not foresee when designing this project? What is the problem with the community's decision? Can you think of a way around this? (Hint: what is the government's program with regard to water and electricity? Could the community mirror this in their arrangements?)